Culturally Relevant Pedagogy
Start Where You are, But Don’t Stay There!

Rich Milner, PhD

Director, University of Pittsburgh Center for Urban Education
Helen Faison Chair in Urban Education, Professor of Education
Courtesy Appointments: Professor of Sociology,
Professor of Social Work, and Professor of Africana Studies
Editor-in-Chief, Urban Education

Rmilner@pitt.edu
@MilnerHRich
@PittCUE
Follow Me

@MilnerHRich
Too Much Schooling
Reminder #1

• Remember **Who** You are Teaching!
Reminder #2

- Remember Your Students are Developing Beings!
- Social Reproduction
Punishment Referral
National Data

Students
National K-12 in-school suspensions by race and ethnicity

National K-12 out-of-school suspensions by race and ethnicity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race/Ethnicity</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>51.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic</td>
<td>23.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>15.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Indian/Alaska Native</td>
<td>1.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>1.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native Hawaiian/Other Pacific</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islander</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two or More Races</td>
<td>2.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native Hawaiian/Other Pacific</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islander</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
National K-12 expulsions by race and ethnicity

South Carolina
State of South Carolina In-School Suspensions by race and ethnicity

State of South Carolina Out-of-School Suspensions by race and ethnicity

State of South Carolina Expulsions by race and ethnicity

Richland County District 1 in-school suspensions by race and ethnicity

Richland County District 1
out-of-school school suspensions by race and ethnicity

Richland County District 1 expulsions by race and ethnicity

Richland County District 2 student population by race and ethnicity

- Black: 58.6%
- White: 27.5%
- Hispanic: 7.3%
- Asian: 3.0%
- Two or More Races: 3.1%
- Native Hawaiian/Other Pacific Islander: 0.3%
- American Indian/Alaska Native: 0.2%

Richland County District 2 in-school suspensions by race and ethnicity

Richland County District 2 out-of-school school suspensions by race and ethnicity

Richland County District 2 expulsions by race and ethnicity

Disproportionality
(California Department of Education)

• “Disproportionality means that there are more (or fewer) children from a particular group who are experiencing a given situation than we would expect, based on the group’s representation in the general population”

Big Themes Covered

• Time on Task – Missed Instructional Time and Test Score Results (Woolfolk Hoy, 2015)

• Punishment Versus Discipline (Duncan-Andrade, 2017)

• Black and Brown students referred for Subjective Infractions.
• White students referred for Objective ones (Skiba, 2004; Skiba, 2011)
Reminder #3

• Race Still Matters.
Race has nothing to do with it?

“Our principal invited you here to talk to us about specific strategies to teach our poor children. I was devouring what you had to say — you were right on target — until you got to this race stuff. 

*Race has nothing to do with how to teach my kids living in poverty.* What does it matter? Really!”

*(Rac(e)ing to Class, p. 4)*
Defining Race

• Socially (Ladson-Billings & Tate, 1994)

• Legally (Harris, 1993)
  • Plessy v. Ferguson
  • Brown v. Board
  • Milliken v. Bradley

• Historically (Anderson, 1988)

• Physically (Monroe, 2013)

• Contextually (Tate, 1997)
Defining Racism

“The transformation of racial prejudice into...racism through the use of power directed against racial group(s) and their members, who are defined as inferior by individuals, institutional members, and leaders, which is reflected in policy and procedures with the intentional and unintentional support and participation...”

(Carter, 2007, p. 24)
Why is it so difficult to have conversations about race, especially in “mixed” company?
Colorblindness

People sometimes claim that they were raised to “just see people,” and to not think about race.

This thinking carries over into their conceptions of their work:

• **Mindset 1**: If I acknowledge the racial or ethnic background of my students or myself, then I may be considered racist.

• **Mindset 2**: If I admit that people experience and see the world differently, I may be seen as politically incorrect. I may offend others (students, colleagues) if I express my beliefs and reservations about race.

• **Mindset 3**: I should treat all my students the same, regardless of who they are, what their home situations are, or what their experiences related to race happen to be.
Implications for Practice

• **Classroom Level:** It is critical that teachers recognize students’ racial and backgrounds in order to plan for, work with, and teach (more) complete students rather than fragmented disconnected students. It **still** matters that I am a Black man.

• Adoption of color-blind ideologies make it difficult to recognize systemic/broader disparities and dilemmas such as

  • An over-representation of students of color in special education
  • An under-representation of students of color in gifted education
  • An over-referral of African American students to the office
  • An overwhelming number of African American and Hispanic students expelled or suspended.

• Some believe that surely it is the students themselves who cause themselves to end up in these situations and not our perfectly flawless policies and procedures.

• It’s difficult to recognize these destructive patterns when we do not approach our work with a cultural (or racial) eye.
When do young people start to think about race?

• A Bedtime Story
Students’ Academic Achievement is Related to Strong Racial Identity
How Does Teacher Diversity Compare with Student Diversity?

Notes: Students are defined as all individuals ages 5 to 17; teachers are defined as individuals ages 25 to 34, with a bachelor’s degree, who are teachers at the prekindergarten through high school level.

(Urban Institute, 2017)
Teachers’ Beliefs about Discussing Race

Teachers and Race Talk Survey (Milner, Delale-O’Connor, Murray, & Alvarez, 2016)

• 33-item exploratory survey
  • 9 demographic
  • 12 close-ended (“yes”, “no”, and “not sure” response options)
  • 12 open-ended

• Administered online through Qualtrics
  • Schools/Colleges of Education at AAU member institutions
  • LRA listserv
  • Local/Regional Pennsylvania universities

• N = 422
Findings and Interpretations

Do teachers believe it is important to discuss race with their students?

• 86% of White in-service teachers reported that race is important to discuss

Do teachers feel prepared to discuss race with their students?

• 55% of White in-service teachers reported feeling prepared to discuss race
Findings and Interpretations

White Teachers (n=202)

- Percentage of Teachers: 86 (Important) 55 (Prepared)
Findings and Interpretations

White Teacher Differences by Student Race

- Black (n=33): 97% Important, 58% Prepared
- Brown (n=22): 82% Important, 55% Prepared
- Diverse (n=64): 88% Important, 65% Prepared
- White (n=79): 81% Important, 48% Prepared
Reminder #4

• When the Music Changes, so should the Dance!

• Cynthia Dillard
• The average age when a child begins regularly consuming online media is 8
• Even though Facebook’s minimum age requirement is 13, there are about 5 million users under the age of 10
• About 10 hours and 45 minutes per day are spent online (for 8-18 year olds)
• 25% of teens log into to social media 10+ times per day
• 51% of kids say they’ve been bullied online, and 49% say they have been the online bully
• Only 50% of parents have installed parental controls for their kids online interactions, but 72% worry that their kids will reveal inappropriate information online
• 88% of teens value social media because it helps them keep in touch with friends they don’t see often
Real Dissonance Between Inside and Outside of School Realities
Reminder #5

Poverty and Merit
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Persons in family</th>
<th>48 Contiguous States and D.C.</th>
<th>Alaska</th>
<th>Hawaii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>$11,880</td>
<td>$14,840</td>
<td>$13,670</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>16,020</td>
<td>20,020</td>
<td>18,430</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>20,160</td>
<td>25,200</td>
<td>23,190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>24,300</td>
<td>30,380</td>
<td>27,950</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>28,440</td>
<td>35,560</td>
<td>32,710</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>32,580</td>
<td>40,740</td>
<td>37,470</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>36,730</td>
<td>45,920</td>
<td>42,230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>40,890</td>
<td>51,120</td>
<td>47,010</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For each additional person, add

- $4,160
- $5,200
- $4,780
Socio-Economic Status and Meritocracy

**Meritocracy** - the idea that people are rewarded based (solely or mostly) on their ability, performance, and talents.

• Mindset 1: All groups of people were born with the same opportunities. If people follow a formula – work hard, put forth effort, and follow the law – then they will be successful.
  • Actors, athletes, Oprah, etc.

• Mindset 2: If people do not succeed, it is because they are not working hard enough, not because of other factors outside of their control.
Voices of Teachers

• “I get so sick of people making something out of nothing...My grandparents immigrated to this country with nothing, and they made something of their lives because they worked hard...”

• Beverly Gordon’s insight

• “I’m going to be the kind of teacher who follows your advice and have high expectations...if a student is not turning in his homework [on time], I’m not going to give any slack...It’s going to be a zero in my grade book.”
Implications for Practice

• Factors beyond ability, talent, effort, and hard work can contribute to students’ academic and social success.

• If the meritocracy argument were completely accurate, sociologist James Henslin (2015) wrote:
  ...
  all positions would be awarded on the basis of merit. If so, ability should predict who goes to college. Instead, family income is the best predictor — the more a family earns, the more likely their children are to go to college...while some people do get ahead through ability and hard work, others simply inherit wealth and the opportunities that go with it...in short, factors far beyond merit give people their positions in society. (p. 174)
How People Succeed in Society

• Trust funds passed down through generations

• Property (homes, land, etc.) passed down through generations

• Financed college education without having to accrue student loan debt

• Private and independent school tuition and education

• Outside-of-school tutoring in academic subjects
How People Succeed in Society

• Exposure to other cultures and languages
• Financial assistance with graduate studies
• Preparatory programs for the SAT, ACT, and GRE
• Vacations foreign and domestic
• Zoned school systems with advanced educational resources, curriculum materials, and strong educators and administrators
Free and reduced price lunch nationally

National free and reduced lunch eligibility 2013-14 school year

50.2% Eligible
49.8% Not eligible
Language Shifts

Poverty is a result of Conditions and Situations

Should not be seen as a descriptor of people or group of people

People living below the Poverty Line Versus Poor People
There is NO Culture of Poverty!

With no apologies to Oscar Lewis
or Ruby Payne!

Culture Versus Cultural Practices
Reminder #6

• Curriculum should Connect!
Three Forms of Curriculum

Explicit

Implicit

Null

E. Eisner (1994)
Vicarious Trauma

• When Students Experience Trauma Based on Their Perceived Connections to Others?

• How do you handle these situations in your classroom?
Reminder #7

• Our Talk Matters!
Beyond Achievement Gap
Talk
Irvine, Ladson-Billings, Milner

• An Instruction Gap
• A Caring Gap
• A Policy Gap
• An Access Gap
• Resource Gap
• An Assessment Gap
• A School Counseling Gap
• A Wealth, Income and Funding Gap
Beyond Achievement Gap
Talk
Irvine, Ladson-Billings, Milner

- Geography of Opportunity Gap
- An Early Childhood Education Gap
- A Health Care Gap
- A Community-Schools Connection Gap
- A School and Pop Culture Gap
- A Research Gap
- An Opportunity Gap
Rac(e)ing to Class
Confronting Poverty and Race in Schools and Classrooms
H. RICHARD MILNER IV
FOREWORD BY TYRONE HOWARD

“With a growing focus on poverty, race, and equality in America, Milner’s timely and sophisticated book deserves widespread discussion and debate. His subtle and sensitive analyses are just what we need.”
—CORNEL WEST
Reminder #8

• Instruction should be Relevant and Responsive!
Who has a culture?

....Everybody is a member of a Cultural Group!!! – Even White People
Culturally Responsive Pedagogy

• Allows students (and teachers) to answer the important question—WHY?

• It provides explicit answers to how the world works

• What is it about this content/lesson/topic/issue/construct/area that is relevant to me and my life currently or in the future?

• Uses students’ culture as a resource/not a liability to enhance learning opportunities
Culturally Responsive Teaching

• It allows students to question what they find to be inequitable.

• It gives students voice and perspective in the classroom.

• It affords students opportunities to think about what is happening in their local communities and to complete projects that address matters they can understand locally.
Culturally Relevant Teaching

• According to Ladson-Billings (2009)
  • Students must experience academic success.

• Students must develop, and sustain (Paris & Alim) cultural competence.
  • It is not bad to be a “female” or a Latina student
  • Add to, not take away

• Students must develop a critical consciousness.
  • Once you know about something inappropriate in your community, you should do something about it.
Self-Efficacy (Bandura, 1997)

• Mastery Experiences

• Vicarious Experiences

• Verbal Persuasion

• Psychological and Emotional States
A ROBBERY STORY...
Who Can Teach in This Way?

Evidence is clear that teachers from any racial, ethnic, or cultural background can be successful teachers of any group of students!
Reminder #9

• Build your Professional Library!
Making the Case

- Color by Number
  - Understanding Racism Through Facts and Stats on Children
  - By Art Munin

- Savage Inequalities
  - Children in America's Schools
  - By Jonathan Kozol

- Why Race and Culture Matter in Schools
  - Closing the Achievement Gap in America's Classrooms
  - By Tyrone C. Howard
Conceptual Framing: Race and Language
Conceptual Framing: Race and Teaching
Conceptual Framing: Structural Inequity
Reminder #10: Consider Some Radical Practices
Jennings, Missouri

• Hope House -- Homeless Shelter/Residency-On Campus Housing (Nativity Model)

• Washer and Dryers on the School Property open to Students and Families

• Doctors, Pediatricians, and Mental Health Counselors Provided
Jennings, Missouri

• Food Pantry – Basic Food Items Available to Students and Families

• Saturday School (increase the number of hours for learning) – College Prep, Accelerated Learning

• Pay for College Courses Towards and Associate’s Degree
Jennings, Missouri

• Restoration of the Arts in the District (Music, Art, Dance)

• Teacher Incentives: New Teachers Earn Full Salary while working with an Experienced Teacher

• Positive Feedback, Strong Morale, Words of Affirmation
Recommendations

✓ Increase the Number of Adults in Every Classroom (Noguera)
✓ Incorporate Language and Literacy Development Across the Curriculum
✓ Provide Continual Study Skill Courses/Opportunities
✓ Teach Organizational Skills
Recommendations

✓ Provide Mentoring Programs (inside and outside of school)
✓ Family Support Mechanisms – health care, job placement, English language learning development
✓ Reduce class size for school dependent students (that is, for students who rely heavily on school for their academic, social, emotional, behavioral, and affective development)
Keep in touch!

- cue.pitt.edu
- Rmilner@pitt.edu
- @MilnerHRich

@PittCUE